

1. **Science  $\iff$  Policy.** What policy is advocated? Is the science clearly explained; does it justify the proposed policy? Are serious objections to the policy admitted and answered?
  
2. **Structure.** Is the paper aided by its structure – (i) division into major sections, (ii) their development in paragraphs, and (iii) cumulative progress to main conclusion?
  
3. **Illustration.** Are any illustrations clearly helpful to take-home message? Does the text cite/use the illustration? Does caption turn illustration into stand-alone support for policy?
  
4. **Abstract, Intro & Conclusion.** Does the ...  
**Abstract:** Identify main points, science, and results? Is the proposed policy specified?

**Introduction:** Clearly present **topic strings** that drive the paper?

**Conclusion:** Summarize the main points of the paper, including the proposed policy? Does it introduce new material not covered in the paper?

5. **Topic Sentences.** Underline the topic sentences in the text. Comment/rewrite *each* directly on paper. Put general comments on topic sentences here.
  
6. **How would you improve the paper?**

**Return the paper with this report.**

Author: \_\_\_\_\_ Reviewer: \_\_\_\_\_