1. **Science ⇐⇒ Policy.** What policy is advocated? Is the science clearly explained; does it justify the proposed policy? Are serious objections to the policy admitted and answered?

2. **Structure.** Is the paper aided by its structure – (i) division into major sections, (ii) their development in paragraphs, and (iii) cumulative progress to main conclusion?

3. **Illustration.** Are any illustrations clearly helpful to take-home message? Does the text cite/use the illustration? Does caption turn illustration into stand-alone support for policy?

4. **Abstract, Intro & Conclusion.** Does the …
   - **Abstract:** Identify main points, science, and results? Is the proposed policy specified?
   - **Introduction:** Clearly present **topic strings** that drive the paper?
   - **Conclusion:** Summarize the main points of the paper, including the proposed policy? Does it introduce new material not covered in the paper?

5. **Topic Sentences.** **Underline** the topic sentences in the text. Comment/rewrite each directly on paper. Put general comments on topic sentences here.

6. **How would you improve the paper?**